Workpackage 3. Education

Task 3. Multilingual Higher Education

Ph.D. thesis
The multilingual competence in Higher Education

Elisa Caruso
UALG - Universidade do Algarve, Portugal

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Community’s Seventh Framework Programme under grant agreement No. 613344 (Project MIME).
### Multilingual Higher Education and trade-off between mobility and inclusion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Existing criteria</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Trade-off between mobility and inclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Use of lingua franca, widespread use of English, also for whole masters and doctoral courses (increasing) | • “Linguistic security”  
• Mother tongue maintenance  
• Online assessment before and at the end of the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff  
• Linguistic support during the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff (online in outgoing and in situ in incoming)  
• Organisation of cultural activities  
• Support to the reintegration of mobile participants  
• Virtual mobility | • Explicit plan of multilingualism/plurilingualism  
• Recognized multilingual practises  
• ESCO (multilingual classification of European Skills, Competences, Qualifications and Occupations)  
• Language Passport  
• Lifelong learning |
| • Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL)  
• Certification's exams in accordance with CEFR  
• Website versions in different languages  
• Translation of communication materials  
• Validation of non-formal and informal learning | | |
| • “Linguistic security”  
• Mother tongue maintenance  
• Online assessment before and at the end of the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff  
• Linguistic support during the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff (online in outgoing and in situ in incoming)  
• Organisation of cultural activities  
• Support to the reintegration of mobile participants  
• Virtual mobility | | |
| • Online assessment before and at the end of the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff (online in outgoing and in situ in incoming) | | |
| • Organisation of cultural activities | | |
| • Support to the reintegration of mobile participants | | |
| • Virtual mobility | | |
| • Explicit plan of multilingualism/plurilingualism  
• Recognized multilingual practises  
• ESCO (multilingual classification of European Skills, Competences, Qualifications and Occupations)  
• Language Passport  
• Lifelong learning | | |
| Possible problems | Validation but no certification for informal, non-formal learning  
• No recognition of language varieties | No recognition of minority languages  
• Hierarchy among languages and no linguistic equality in speaker's perception  
• Language/culture lost  
• No evaluation of oral competences in online assessment  
• Linguistic problems in transition | Commodification  
Decapitalisation of knowledge |
| • Recognition of non-formal and informal learning | Acceptance/(multi)belonging  
• “Regional location, international orientation” | Multilingual competence  
• Intercomprehension and receptive multilingualism as communicative strategy  
• Recognised multilingual courses  
• Awareness of linguistic diversity |

Sources: Erasmus+ Programme Guide; Universities’ sites; Inception Report; articles in references.
# Multilingual Higher Education and trade-off between mobility and inclusion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Existing criteria</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Trade-off between mobility and inclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Use of lingua franca, widespread use of English, also for whole masters and doctoral courses (increasing)</td>
<td>“Linguistic security”</td>
<td>Explicit plan of multilingualism/plurilingualism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL)</td>
<td>Mother tongue maintenance</td>
<td>Recognized multilingual practises</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification's exams in accordance with CEFR</td>
<td>Online assessment before and at the end of the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff</td>
<td>ESCO (multilingual classification of European Skills, Competences, Qualifications and Occupations)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Website versions in different languages</td>
<td>Linguistic support during the mobility period for students, researchers, teachers and staff (online in outgoing and in situ in incoming)</td>
<td>Language Passport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation of communication materials</td>
<td>Organisation of cultural activities</td>
<td>Lifelong learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validation of non-formal and informal learning</td>
<td>Support to the reintegration of mobile participants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Virtual mobility</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible problems</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Trade-off between mobility and inclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Validation but no certification for informal, non-formal learning</td>
<td>No recognition of minority languages</td>
<td>Commodification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No recognition of language varieties</td>
<td>Hierarchy among languages and no linguistic equality in speaker's perception</td>
<td>Decapitalisation of knowledge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Language/culture lost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No evaluation of oral competences in online assessment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Linguistic problems in transition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible solutions</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Trade-off between mobility and inclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recognition of non-formal and informal learning</td>
<td>Acceptance/(multi)belonging</td>
<td>Multilingual competence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Regional location, international orientation”</td>
<td>Intercomprehension and receptive multilingualism as communicative strategy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recognised multilingual courses</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Awareness of linguistic diversity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Erasmus+ Programme Guide; Universities’ sites; Inception Report; articles in references.
“Multilingual competence in Higher Education”

Research topics

• Concept of multilingual competence
• Perception of the role of languages in Higher Education
• Use and development of the multilingual competence in Higher Education at individual and collective level
• Relationship between multilingual competence, mobility and inclusion in Higher Education
The concept of multilingual competence

• "The first conceptualisation of multicompetence was as 'the compound state of a mind with two grammars' (Cook, 1991) The current definition of multi-competence to be used here is then ‘the knowledge of more than one language in the same mind or the same community’ (Cook, 2011)." (Cook, 2015: 2)

• "The mother tongue(s) is/are not excluded from this process: every (new) language acquisition modifies the global language competence of individuals and shapes their linguistic repertoires.” (Piccardo, 2010)

• "On ne considère plus les langues pratiquées par une personne plurilingue comme une simple addition de 'systèmes linguistiques' (plus ou moins approximatifs) appréhendés chacun pour soi (Grogjean, 1985; Lüdi & Py, 1984), mais comme une espèce de 'compétence intégrée'" (Lüdi, 2011: 54)
Multilingual Competence in Higher Education

“2.1. Multilingual and multicultural academic communication competence is an individual’s communicative and interactive repertoire, made up of several languages and language varieties including first language(s) at different levels of proficiency, and various types of competence, which are all interrelated. The repertoire in its entirety represents a resource enabling action in diverse use situations. It evolves across time and experience throughout life, and includes growth in intercultural awareness and ability to cope with, and participate in, multicultural contexts of academic study and working life”

(MAGICC - Modularising multilingual and multicultural academic and professional communication competence for BA and MA level, Räsänen, Natri & Foster Vosick 2013: 6)
Methodology

Case studies

Learning/teaching
• Course “Políticas de língua e comunicação” at the Universidade do Algarve, in Portugal (March-May 2016)

Research
• Research team CIMA – Centro de Investigação Matinha e Ambiental at the Universidade do Algarve, in Portugal (March-July 2017)

Internationalisation
• International reception at the Universitat Rovira i Virgili, Tarragona, in Catalunya, in Spain (September 2016)

Multilingual competence course
• Course “SprachRäume – Interkulturelle und Multilinguale Gesprächsrunden” at the Universität Basel, in Switzerland (April 2016)
## Case study 1
Multilingual competence in learning / teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Classroom of the course “Políticas de língua e comunicação”  
• 3rd year of the Bachelor Degree in “Línguas e Comunicação”  
• Universidade do Algarve, Portugal | • 6 local students  
• 7 mobility students (6 from France and 1 from Italy)  
• 1 professor  
• (1 researcher)  
• Tot. 15 | • Observation (17 hours), including recording and transcriptions (11 hours)  
• 2 questionnaires (17 items) |
Case study 1
Linguistic repertoires
Case study 1
“Linguistic rules” in the classroom

Based on this multilingual arena, the professor proposed, for the language management of the course, to follow *linguistic rules*:

1. **Everyone is free to speak their preferred language**, on the condition that the teacher understands it or that it can be translated for a collective understanding.

2. **One of the final presented works will be done in three languages**, chosen by the students:
   - A language for the PowerPoint presentation;
   - A language for the oral exposition;
   - A language to answer questions by the professor and other students.

3. Moreover, during the course the professor has proposed **scientific texts in English**, which were analysed and discussed in different languages.
## Case study 1

### Result of the “linguistic rules”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Classroom space</th>
<th>Team space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Writing languages (whiteboard or slide presentation)</td>
<td>Oral languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Professor</strong></td>
<td>English</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>French</td>
<td>French</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>Portuguese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students</strong></td>
<td>English</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>French</td>
<td>French</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>Portuguese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Case study 1
Multilingual practices occurred during the observation

The multilingual practices that occurred during the observation can be summarized in the following list:

1) Reading a text in a language and discussing around it in other languages;
2) Use of English key scientific terms in discussion in another language;
3) Metalinguistic reflection about terms in different languages;
4) Use of multilingual repetition and translation across languages;
5) Taking notes in various languages;
6) Reciprocal linguistic assistance in written and oral production;
7) Use of multilingual communication among students and professor;
8) Use of the multilingual repertoires as a resource and as a negotiation for meaning.
## Case study 2
### Multilingual competence in research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Multilingual and multicultural research group at the CIMA centre - Centro de Investigação Marinha e Ambiental  
• Universidade do Algarve, Portugal | • **25 respondents** (4 Master, 5 Ph.D., 6 post-doc, 6 researchers, 3 adjunct or auxiliary professors, 1 full professor) | • 1 questionnaire (40 items)  
• 6 personal interviews |
Case study 2
Languages in academic education and in scientific production

1) In which languages were your courses taught during your university education and in what percentage? (e.g. English 60%, French 30%, Portuguese 10%)

2) Which languages are used at national or international conferences in which you participate and in what percentage? (e.g. English 50%, Portuguese 40%, Spanish 10%)

3) In which languages are the materials for your research written (books, scientific journals, web sites), and in what percentage?

4) In which languages do you write the materials of your own scientific production (articles, conferences, books), and in what percentage?
## Case study 2 – Interviews

### English as language of scientific production

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Quote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT 1</strong></td>
<td>“nesta altura pelo menos na minha área quando nós publicamos tem que ser para termos um curriculum mais ou menos <strong>temos que publicar em revistas indexadas ou revistas que tenham um fator de impacto considerável e estas coisas todas e então estas revistas são todas na língua inglesa”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT 2</strong></td>
<td>“na minha área eu nem escrevo nada em português mesmo quando são coisas que eu poderia escrever em português (...) sai sai logo em inglês nem nem penso e os artigos <strong>nunca escrevi nada em português tudo em inglês”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT 3</strong></td>
<td><strong>“É até porque quase todos querem publicar então é mais fácil e mais rápido escreverem logo em inglês porque depois tentam então submeter o artigo logo a seguir não é preciso depois estar a traduzir tudo assim simplificam o trabalho”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IT</strong></td>
<td>“Per cui si la capacità di di interagire di lavorare in inglese quella è proprio essenziale / non ultimo il fatto che si <strong>tutti gli articoli vengono scritti in inglese”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ES</strong></td>
<td>“La gente que yo conozco con los que trabajamos en inglés porque <strong>si tú quieres tener una una calidad o publicar en un sitio para tener un índice tiene que ser en inglés</strong> porque los <strong>papers españoles no están no hay casi”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GR</strong></td>
<td>“la mayor razón que no produzco ni en griego ni en portugués ni en español es que **toda la producción científica que cuenta en nivel en nivel internacional es la producción de los buenos los artículos con índice de impacto y esto es cien por ciento en inglés””</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Case study 2 – Interviews

English as a “mother tongue”

| PT 1 | “Não é a dificuldade que acho que toda a gente tem pelo facto de estar a escrever numa língua que não é a sua que tem muita acaba chega a uma altura que parece que já é” |
| PT 2 | “Não é na parte da escrita é que quer dizer é sai automaticamente já não não penso vou escrever uma coisa de trabalho escrevo em inglês já não não penso” |
| IT  | “non è soltanto come dire non si tratta soltanto di di parlare [in inglese] ma secondo me devi sì non avere proprio difficoltà dev’essere veramente come se fosse un po’ la tua madre lingua”  
   | “Però a livello lavorativo secondo me deve diventare la tua lingua deve perché se no non fai il lavoro” |
## Case study 2 – Interviews
### Forgetfulness of the first language

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT 1</strong></td>
<td>“Às vezes até é o contrário já não conseguimos arranjar um termo para português de uma coisa que usamos muito em inglês por isso sim isso agora já não”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT 2</strong></td>
<td>“Mesmo nós a falar português sobre o nosso trabalho há muitas palavras que dizemos em inglês porque / sei lá mas eu noto muito isso há muita coisa que estou a falar português mas depois utilizo palavras inglesas (...) o inglês já está tão presente que o português fica fica fica esquecido”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“É mais fácil estarem em inglês do que estar a escrever as coisas em português a usar termos que nem sei como é que se traduzem ou que em português ficam estranhos”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IT</strong></td>
<td>“Guarda, questa per esempio è la lista dei cosi più o meno degli acronimi che uso in questa documentazione e per esempio visible infrared radiometer suite eh non ci provi neanche / non ti viene si tante cose son proprio è chiaro che son sugli aspetti più scientifici l’inglese si è sostituito”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Si crea ecco questo sicuramente si crea un secondo vocabolario che per i termini tecnici è migliore nella lingua di lavoro che nella lingua madre”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Case study 3
Multilingual competence in internationalisation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• International Centre</td>
<td>• 45/46 international incoming students</td>
<td>• 2 questionnaires: one questionnaire with 14 items to students, one questionnaire with 23 items to staff members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Universitat Rovira i Virgili, Tarragona, Catalunya, Spain</td>
<td>• 6 staff members at the International Centre</td>
<td>• Observation and recording</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tot. 52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Case study 3
Linguistic repertoires of students
“Els grans objectius persegueixen l’avenç cap a l’ús normal i preferent del català com a llengua pròpia, l’augment del poliglotisme dels universitaris i el foment del multilingüisme, la millora de la qualitat de les produccions lingüístiques de la Universitat i, finalment, la implicació de la comunitat universitària en la política lingüística.” (p. 7)

“La contemporització de tots dos reptes és possible mitjançant la distribució funcional de les llengües en els diferents àmbits d’ús: fent predominar el català a la docència de grau (un àmbit on encara queda camí per recórrer) i fomentant el multilingüisme (bàsicament català, castellà i anglès) a la docència de postgrau i la recerca.” (p. 8)
## Case study 3
### Questionnaire to students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language courses</th>
<th>Number of students</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both Catalan and Spanish</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only Catalan</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>(8 with Spanish as L1 + 12 with other L1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only Spanish</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither Catalan or Spanish</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>(1 with Spanish and Galician as L1 + 1 with Spanish and Valencian as L1 + 4 with other L1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Language courses levels

- **Catalan**
  - A1: 21
  - A2: 8
  - B1: 1

- **Spanish**
  - A1: 6
  - A2: 6
  - B1: 4
  - B2: 2
  - C1: 3
  - C2: 3
Case study 3
Questionnaire to students

In choosing the courses for your Learning Agreement, have you been influenced more by the subject or by the language the course is given in? (1 = only by the subject, 5 = only by the language)

With respect to your studies, how do you perceive the possibility of taking courses in different languages at the URV? (1 = as a problem, 5 = as an opportunity/advantage)
## Case study 4
### Multilingual competence course

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Course “SprachRäume – Interkulturelle und multilinguale Gesprächsrunden”
• Sprachenzentrum of the Universität Basel, Switzerland | • 4 local students
• 3 mobility students
• 2 staff members
• 4 professors
• **Tot. 13** | • Participant observation
• 2 questionnaires
• 3 interviews |
Case study 4
Linguistic repertoires
## Case study 4
### Participant observation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practices in teaching/learning methods</th>
<th>Input in different languages (German, French, Italian and English)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Themes about multilingualism and interculturality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freedom to use any language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Metalinguistic reflection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practices in communication</th>
<th>Communication in several languages within team or within the class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intercomprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Code switching and code mixing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Difficulties (and solutions)</th>
<th>Slow conversation in order to allow everybody’s comprehension</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deskmate’s translation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusions (1)

• Very broad linguistic repertoires in the 4 case studies;

• Undeniable spread use of English ("englishisation");

• Use and development of multilingual competence in different ways.
Conclusions (2)

• **Very broad linguistic repertoires in the 4 case studies:**
  – In case study 1 and 4 (classroom and multilingual course) they are used and increased
  – In case study 3 (international mobility) they are stimulated and amplified
  – In case study 2 (research) they are partially lost, with an almost total substitution by English, but the great physical mobility in research enhances informal/non-formal language learning

• **Undeniable spread use of English (“englishisation”);**

• **Use and development of multilingual competence in different ways.**
Conclusions (3)

• Very broad linguistic repertoires in the 4 case studies;

• **Undeniable spread use of English (“englishisation”)**:  
  – in texts in classroom,  
  – in research,  
  – in programmes.

• Use and development of multilingual competence in different ways.
Conclusions (4)

• Very broad linguistic repertoires in the 4 case studies;

• Undeniable spread use of English (“englishisation”);

• Use and development of multilingual competence in different ways:
  – as way of communication and evaluation in classroom (implicit linguistic policy)
  – as a course (explicit linguistic policy)
  – with the promotion of languages’ courses (explicit linguistic policy)
  – throughout the promotion of a wide mobility in HE in learning, teaching, research (indirect linguistic policy)
References (1)


Erasmus+ Programme Guide 2017


Inception Report, MIME


Grazie per l’attenzione!

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Community’s Seventh Framework Programme under grant agreement No. 613344 (Project MIME).